

# SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

TUESDAY, September 04, 2007 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 3:02 P.M.

**BOARD MEMBERS:** WILLIAM MAHAN, CHAIR, Present

PAUL ZINK, VICE-CHAIR, Present

BERNI BERNSTEIN, Present (out from 4:55 p.m. to 4:58 p.m.)

ERIN CARROLL, Present (left at 5:55 p.m.)

GLEN DEISLER, Present GARY MOSEL, Present DENISE WOOLERY, Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: GRANT HOUSE

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** STELLA LARSON **STAFF:** JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor, Present

HEATHER BAKER, Project Planner, Present (from 5:06 p.m. to 7:21 p.m.)

GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary, Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

-		
SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street)  Photographs - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.  Plans - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.  Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations - (Include on first drawing)  Site Plan - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.  Exterior elevations - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.  Plans - floor, roof, etc.  Rough sketches are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions:  Plans - floor, roof, etc.  Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.  Preliminary Landscape Plans - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.  Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.  Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions:  Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.  Cut Sheets - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.  Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.  Final Landscape Plans - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.  Consultant/Engineer Plans - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

#### **GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A. Public Comment:

No Comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of August 20, 2007, with

corrections.

Action: Bernstein/Carroll, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent.)

C. Consent Calendar.

1. Ratify the Consent Calendar of August 27, 2007.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Glen Deisler.

Action: Deisler/Zink, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent.)

2. Ratify the Consent Calendar of September 4, 2007.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Glen Deisler with

the exception of the landscaping for Items D and A, reviewed by Erin Carroll.

Action: Deisler/Zink, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent.)

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
  - 1. Mr. Limon reported that Board member Woolery will be absent.
  - 2. Member Bernstein announced that Susan Susankaa will conduct a lecture to discuss "building better, not bigger" will take place Thursday, September 6<sup>th</sup>, at 7 p.m. in the Marjory Luke Center, Program of Santa Barbara Junior High School.
  - 3. Member Carroll announced that he will leave early.
- E. Subcommittee Reports.

No reports

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

1. 118 CALLE BELLO A-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-340-007 Application Number: MST2007-00385 Owner: Paul and Marianne Gertman

Architect: Bildsten and Sherwin

(Proposal for 248 cubic yards of cut and fill grading and sitework for new landscaped terrace and pool, enclosed pool house, open pergola, new solar photovoltaic panels and solar water heating panels on the southern, sloped portion of the 1.1 acre parcel in the Hillside Design District.)

# (COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

Time: 3:11

Present: Ellen Bildsten, Architect; Mary and Paul Gertman, Owners.

Public comment opened at 3:21 p.m. The following individual spoke in favor or opposition:

Paula Westbury, opposed.

Public comment closed at 3:22 p.m.

# **Motion:** Continued two weeks to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Develop an apparent south elevation and two side elevations showing the entire proposal and the existing house.
- 2) Provide a conceptual landscape plan. Soften the landscaping by curving the stairs and walls to integrate and blend with the hillside.
- 3) The Board will require that the cut and fill to be balanced.
- 4) Clarify the existing pool cabaña fencing. Provide details of the trellis, pool cabaña, and railings.

Action: Bernstein/Carroll, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent.)

# **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

#### 2. 3035 PASEO DEL DESCANSO

E-3/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-192-012 Application Number: MST2007-00154

Owner: Maria Del Carmen and Manuel De Alarcon

Architect: Bill Poehler

(Proposal for a two-story 2,724 square foot single-family residence, including 468 square foot attached two-car garage. The existing one-story 840 square foot residence and 231 square foot, one-car garage on the 6,841 square foot lot will be demolished. The proposal will result in a FAR of 0.40. Staff Hearing officer approval of a modification is requested to provide non-conforming open yard area.)

# (COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A MODIFICATION.)

### (THE PROPOSAL IS ABOVE 85% MAXIMUM FAR OF 2,474 SQUARE FEET.)

Time: 3:40

Present: Bill Poehler, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:56 p.m. The following individual(s) spoke in favor or opposition:

Wes Brown, resident: concerned with size, bulk, scale, paving.

Kathianne Brown, resident: opposed to lack of open space, incompatibility to neighborhood.

Heidi Heitkamp, resident: opposed to lack of open space and views, size, bulk, and scale.

Paula Westbury, resident: opposed.

Public comment closed at 4:06 p.m.

<u>Board comment</u>: the Board would like the modification held until the Board receives a supportable conceptual design.

# **Motion:** Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following conditions:

- 1) Applicant is to verify accuracy of FAR.
- 2) Study the reducing the size, bulk, scale of the design. As proposed, the size is unacceptable.
- 3) Study the massing so that it does not hinder the neighbor's views, if possible.
- 4) Provide a landscape plan. Consider an entry walk that is separate from driveway. Consider a street tree on Paseo Del Descanso.
- 5) Restudy the recessed front door to be more street friendly, such as a porch.

Action: Bernstein/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent.)

# **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

### 3. 835 W VALERIO ST R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-211-001 Application Number: MST2007-00282

Owner: Manuel Castro
Applicant: Ubaldo Diaz
Architect: Gil Garcia

(Proposal for a 2,309 square foot two-story single-family residence including attached 478 square foot two-car garage on a 5,250 square foot lot. The existing one-story 728 square foot residence and attached 271 square foot garage would be demolished. The proposal has a FAR of 0.44.)

# (Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Time: 4:26

Present: Gil Garcia, Architect; Ubaldo Diaz, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 4:34 p.m. The following individual(s) spoke in favor or opposition:

Paula Westbury, resident: opposed.

Public comment closed at 4:35 p.m.

### **Motion:** Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Remove the garage arcade.
- 2) Provide a landscape plan including stepping stones.
- 3) Provide a perspective drawing as viewed from the street.
- 4) Provide photos of the 20 closest homes.
- 5) Clarify other details that aid the project's size, bulk, and scale to be in keeping with the neighborhood, such as the archway over the front door and the garage doors.
- 6) Provide permeable paving for the driveway, and a reduction of hardscape.

Action: Mosel/Carroll, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein, Woolery absent.)

# **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

### 4. 1921 EL CAMINO DE LA LUZ

E-3/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-100-023 Application Number: MST2007-00001 Owner: Thomas Kenneth Felkay

Architect: Gale Goldberg Engineer: M. Grant

Agent: Souter Land Use Consulting

(Proposal for a 3,918 square foot two-story single-family residence including 460 square foot two-car garage on a 33,922 square foot vacant lot. The project includes an upper level deck and patio, new retaining walls, landscaping, and 290 cubic yards of cut and fill grading within the building footprint. Planning Commission approval of a coastal development permit is requested. The proposal has a FAR of 0.12.)

# (COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT.)

Time: 4:58

Present: Syndi Souter, Agent; Gale Goldberg, Architect; Mr. and Mrs. Felkay, Owners.

Staff comments: Jaime Limon reported that staff has determined that project is subject to Environmental Impact Review Study. Staff will be thoroughly analyzing project environmental impacts and obtaining peer review of the geological report.

Public comment opened at 5:25 p.m. The following individual(s) spoke in favor or opposition:

Chair Mahan acknowledged public comment letters from: Tanda Jennings, Robert Stenson, Mindy Thomas, Barbara Doolittle, Joanne Thompson Adams. Mr. Mahan requested that late arriving letters be forward for the Board's review prior to the next meeting.

Paula Westbury, resident: opposed.

Nancy Brock, resident: neither. Documents submitted: comment letter, photographs, and a preliminary landslide investigation.

Douglas Crawford, resident: neither. Document submitted: letter summarizing Mr. Crawford's findings.

Michael Monteabaro, resident: neither.

Public comment closed at 5:32 p.m.

### **Motion:** Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Provide an analysis of the 20 closest homes.
- 2) Study the length and design of the driveway. Consider a ribbon driveway.
- 3) Study the garage door functionality.
- 4) Note the use of local sandstone on drawings.
- 5) Study the glass screen for an alternative solution.
- 6) Include a low water using compliance statement on the landscape plan
- 7) Study reducing the excessive cantilevers.
- 8) Study the minimum 6-foot setback. Consider stepping down the slope or reducing the structure size.

- 9) Provide drawings of the apparent height, and provide correct apparent height dimensions on the elevations.
- 10) Provide a 3-D prospective looking outward.
- 11) Provide a flat, natural colored, gravel roof material.

Action:

Mosel/Zink, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained: concerned about setting a precedent for the coastal location. Woolery absent.)

### \*\*\*\*\* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:55 P.M. UNTIL 6:21 P.M. \*\*\*\*\*

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**

#### 5. 1418 SANTA ROSA AVE

E-3/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-132-014
Application Number: MST2007-00310
Owner: Santa Rosa Associates LLC

Architect: Richard Thorne

(Proposal for a 2,995 square foot one-story residence including an attached 469 square foot two-car garage on a 9,288 square foot lot, which is the front lot of a newly created three lot subdivision. All three lots will be served by a 16 foot wide common driveway along the eastern property line. The project includes approximately 143 cubic yards of grading outside the building footprint. Planning Commission approved the Tentative Subdivision Map, Modifications, Public Street Waiver, and Coastal Development Permit for the project under MST2006-00288. The proposal has a FAR of 0.32.)

# (PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 023-07.)

### (THE PROPOSAL IS ABOVE 85% MAXIMUM FAR OF 2,994 SQUARE FEET.)

Time: 6:21

Present: Richard Thorne, Architect; Rich Ridgeway, Owner.

Mr. Limon, Senior Planner, distributed the Planning Commission Resolution which specified the Board to review specific items regarding the project.

Public comment opened at 6:32 p.m. The following individual(s) spoke in favor or opposition:

Paula Westbury, resident, opposed.

Public comment closed at 6:34 p.m.

Straw vote: how many Board members are willing to waive the 20 closest homes study on this project due to lot size? 3/0/0.

Motion: Preliminary Approval as basis for working drawings, with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and return on Consent Calendar with the following comments:

1) Provide a landscape plan showing permeable paving wherever possible. Consider a deciduous trees for passive solar use.

- 2) Remove the dormers.
- 3) Provide a 5-foot screen fence for privacy in the courtyard.
- 4) Provide a 300 square foot area for future photovoltaic installation.
- 5) Provide uniform exterior lighting and way finding signage at the pedestrian walkway.
- 6) The project is compatible in size, bulk, and scale of the neighborhood. The consistency in appearance, quality of architecture, and backyard trees are compatible with the neighborhood.
- 7) Final Approval can be made on Consent Calendar.

Action: Zink/Mosel, 5/0/0. Motion carried (Carroll and Woolery absent.)

# **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**

### 6. 1420 SANTA ROSA AVE

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(6:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-132-014
Application Number: MST2007-00312
Owner: Santa Rosa Associates LLC

Architect: Richard Thorne

(Proposal for a 3,060 square foot one-story residence including an attached 541 square foot two-car garage on a 9,262 square foot lot, which is the middle lot of a three lot subdivision. All three lots will be served by a 16 foot wide common driveway along the eastern property line. The project includes approximately 199 cubic yards of grading outside the building footprint. Planning Commission approved the Tentative Subdivision Map, Modifications, Public Street Waiver, and Coastal Development Permit for the project under MST2006-00288. The proposal has a FAR of 0.33.)

# (PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 023-07.)

### (THE PROPOSAL IS ABOVE 85% MAXIMUM FAR OF 2,988 SQUARE FEET.)

Time: 6:53

Present: Richard Thorne, Architect; Rich Ridgeway, Investec.

Public comment opened at 6:58 p.m. The following individual(s) spoke in favor or opposition:

Paula Westbury, resident, opposed.

Public comment closed at 6:59 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary A

Preliminary Approval as a basis for working drawings, with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and return to Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) Provide a landscaping plan showing permeable paving wherever possible, and giving consideration to deciduous trees for passive solar use. Maximize the landscaping, and minimize the hardscape.
- 2) Provide a 5 foot screen fence for privacy in the adjacent unit.
- 3) Provide a 300 square foot area for future photo voltaic installation.

- 4) Provide uniform exterior lighting and way finding signage at the pedestrian walkway.
- 5) Provide permeable paving at entries and walkways. Provide a narrower entry walkway.
- 6) The project is compatible in size, bulk, and scale of the neighborhood. The consistency in appearance, quality of architecture, and backyard trees are compatible with the neighborhood.
- 7) Final Approval can be made when the project returns on Consent Calendar.

Action: Bernstein/Deisler, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Carroll and Woolery absent.)

# **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**

### 7. 1422 SANTA ROSA AVE

E-3/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-132-014
Application Number: MST2007-00313
Owner: Santa Rosa Associates LLC

Architect: Richard Thorne

(Proposal for a 2,413 square foot one-story residence with an attached 628 square foot two-car garage on a 9,239 square foot lot, which is the rear lot of a three lot subdivision. All three lots will be served by a 16 foot wide common driveway along the eastern property line. The project includes approximately 204 cubic yards of grading outside the building footprint. Planning Commission approved the Tentative Subdivision Map, Modifications, Public Street Waiver, and Coastal Development Permit for the project under MST2006-00288. The proposal has a FAR of 0.26.)

# (PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 023-07.)

Time: 7:01

Present: Richard Thorne, Architect; Rich Ridgeway, Owner.

Public comment opened at 7:11 p.m. The following individual(s) spoke in favor or opposition:

Paula Westbury: opposed.

Public comment closed at 7:12 p.m.

# **Motion:** Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Provide a landscape plan for the entire project. Show permeable paving wherever possible and consider a deciduous trees for passive solar use. Maximize the landscaping, and minimize the hardscape.
- 2) Provide a 300 square foot area for future photovoltaic installation.
- 3) Provide uniform exterior lighting and way finding signage.
- 4) Provide a 5 foot screen fence for privacy in the adjacent unit.
- 5) Provide permeable paving at entries and walkways. Narrow the entry walkway.
- 6) Study the use of brick as wainscoting.
- 7) There is concern with the front entry roof and fascia. Study lowering the front roof plate height, and study how that will affect the roof, particularly at the area where the den occurs and the roof appears to be a 12-foot plate height.

Action: Zink/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Carroll and Woolery absent.)

# **SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**

#### 8. 111 BURTON CIR R-4/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-063-007 Application Number: MST2007-00227

Owner: Paul and Jill Cook Architect: Ted Meeder

(Proposal to convert a 1,714 square foot two-story duplex into a 1,647 square foot two-story single-family residence and attached 453 square foot two-car garage on a 3,405 square foot lot. The project consists of exterior alterations and additions of 42 square feet of living space and 386 square feet of garage space. The proposal includes the abatement of violations regarding as-built garage space converted to habitable space. The proposal would result in a FAR of 0.67.)

### (COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

Time: 7:21

Present: Ted Meeder, Architect; Paul Cook, Owner.

Public comment opened at 7:29 p.m.

Paula Westbury: opposed.

Public comment closed at 7:31 p.m.

# **Motion:** Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Applicant to lower the porch plate, and eliminate the short columns of the porch, replace with heavy timber (8" x 8").
- 2) Show appropriate door recesses on the plans.
- 3) Thicken the arch at the side gate.
- 4) Introduce a quadragon window in place of the octagon window.
- 5) Study appropriate molded sills over the garage.
- 6) Provide a landscape plan.

Action: Mosel/Bernstein, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Deisler opposed due to square footage. Carroll and Woolery absent.)

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

#### 9. 1431 SHORELINE DR E-3/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-185-010
Application Number: MST2007-00358
Owner: Lauren Emma 2005 Trust

Architect: Brian Nelson

(Proposal for an 866 square foot two-story addition and a 477 square foot second-story deck for an existing one-story 3,131 square foot single-family residence. The existing detached 620 square foot garage will remain on the 15,156 square foot lot. Planning Commission approval of a Coastal Development Permit is requested. The proposal has a FAR of 0.26.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT.)

Time: 7:49

Present: Brian Nelson, Architect.

Public comment opened at 8:02 p.m. The following individuals spoke in favor or opposition:

Paula Westbury: opposed.

Dennis Gaon: neither.

Public comment closed at 8:08 p.m.

Mr. Limon, Senior Design Review Supervisor, reported that a Coastal Development Permit will be required.

# **Motion:** Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Redesign the deck to be 15 feet from the property line, or consider screening, or both.
- 2) Provide consistency in the balcony railing design.
- 3) Provide a 20 closest homes analysis. Some Board members are concerned that the project is too big.
- 4) Provide a prospective as viewed from the street.
- 5) Show the adjacent neighbor's house and window placement.

Action: Zink/Deisler, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed: unable to support due to size.)

#### **CONSENT CALENDAR**

### **NEW ITEM**

### A. 1438 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-185-007 Application Number: MST2007-00428 Owner: Bea Hyp Trust 12/20/01

Architect: Alex Pujo

(Proposal to construct a 120 long concrete masonry and stucco wall not to exceed six feet in height. The wall will be topped with a sandstone cap and will match an existing wall on the 18,571 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District.)

### (Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final Approval of the project with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and with the following conditions: 1) Provide sandstone stone lined swale for drainage on applicants side of retaining wall. 2) Provide plaster and paint both sides of wall.

### **NEW ITEM**

### B. 1253 DOVER LN E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-220-024 Application Number: MST2007-00406 Owner: Mason Family Trust 4/22/02

(Proposal to demolish an existing 70 square foot day room, and constructing a 391 square foot family room with covered terrace, to an existing 897 square foot single family residence in the Hillside Design District.)

# (Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Preliminary Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and return to Consent Calendar with the comments: 1) Relocate the laundry inside the residence; 2) Show footprints with NPO findings; 3) Show final details for eaves, windows and doors.

# **NEW ITEM**

### C. 1433 JESUSITA LN A-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-240-019 Application Number: MST2007-00431

Owner: Connolly Family Trust 12/12/00

Architect: Steve Morando

(Proposal to construct additional retaining walls at the rear of a single-family residence on a 3 acre lot in the Hillside Design District.)

Continued one week to Consent Calendar with the following comments: 1) Provide a landscape plan providing a "nature palette" 5 feet from existing and proposed walls; 2) Show accurate steps in retaining wall; 3) Provide temporary irrigation plan to ensure plant growth is established. 4) Color and finish of walls to match house. 5) Show compliance with High Fire Hazard Area Landscape requirements.

\*\*\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:28 P.M. \*\*\*\*